

Comparison of the toxicity of three botanical extracts on the second nymph of the citrus mealybug *Planococcus citri* (Risso) under nursery and laboratory conditions

M. Ahmadi and B. Amiri-Besheli

Entomology Department, Sari Agricultural University, Iran, Email: Behnamamiri39@yahoo.com

Abstract

Ahmadi, M. and B. Amiri-Besheli. 2013. Comparison of the toxicity of three botanical extracts on the second nymph of the Citrus Mealybug *Planococcus citri* (Risso) under nursery and laboratory conditions. Arab Journal of Plant Protection, 31(3): 286-290.

Botanical insecticides play an important role in sustainable agriculture. The effect of Tondexir (pepper extract), Sirinol (garlic extract) and Palizin (eucalyptus extract) on citrus mealybug (CM) *Planococcus citri* (Risso) (Homoptera: Pseudococcidae) and coccinellid predator *Cryptoleamus montrouzieri* was investigated. Citrus mealybug was reared on Butternut pumpkin (2-3 kg). Factorial experimental design with random blocks with six replicates was used for each botanical insecticide under nursery conditions. Each toxin was tested separately and CM mortality was recorded at 24, 48, 72 and 96 hours after treatment. Tondexir (3000 ppm) resulted in the highest CM mortality (90.96 ± 2.93%), followed by Palizin (3000 ppm) (89.16±1.92%) and Sirinol (3500 ppm) (87.11±1.11%) 96 h after treatment. Adult emergence was prevented by Tondexir (3000 ppm), Palizin (3000 ppm) and Sirinol (3500 ppm). Among three botanical insecticides, the least LC₅₀ was obtained by Palizin with 811.297 ppm. There were no toxic effects due to the use of the above mentioned botanical pesticides on any of the coccinellid predator *Cryptoleamus montrouzieri* Mulsant (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) stages.

Keywords: Tondexir, Palizin, Sirinol, citrus mealybug, *Planococcus citri*, coccinellid predator, *Cryptoleamus montrouzieri*.

Introduction

Citrus mealybug (CM), *Planococcus citri*, is one of the most important pests of citrus in the world. Keriokhin was the first person who identified this pest in Iran (16). Most of the research regarding the effect of pesticides on CM has been carried out in South Africa, Palestine, Egypt, India, America, Spain, USA and Japan (19). The use of synthetic insecticides has led to numerous problems unforeseen at the time of their introduction, in addition to the evolution of pesticides resistance in pest populations (10). The Coccinellid predator (CP) is one of the biological control agents for the control of CM and is inhibited by chemical pesticides (14). Many different pesticides such as Profenofos, Methidathion, Chlorpyrifos, fenprothrin and Methomyl have been used to control CM (2) but are found harmful to coccinellid beetles (18).

The above mentioned negative effects of using conventional insecticides generated a need to find alternative ways of controlling target pest species (23). Botanical insecticides can be an alternative to conventional pesticides as they are effective against pests, persist for a short period in the field, and are safe and cheap. Four biological pesticides, Biofly (*Beauveria bassiana*), Biovar (*Beauveria bassiana*), Bioranza (*Metarhizium anisopliae*) and orange oil plus two chemical pesticides, Admiral (pyriproxyfen) and Cidial (phenthoate), were used against the pink hibiscus mealybug *Maconellicoccus hirsutus* (Green) (Homoptera: Pseudococcidae). The highest mortality was obtained from Cidial treatment (3). Amongst various options, aqueous extract of neem seeds (kernels of *Azadirachta indica*), *Allium sativum*, *Lantana camara*, *Annona squamosa*, *carica papaya*, etc. were highly effective for the control of coffee mealy bugs (21).

The aim of this study was to investigate the effect of Tondexir (pepper extract), Sirinol (garlic extract) and Palizin (Eucalyptus extract) on citrus mealybug,

Planococcus citri (Risso) (Homoptera: Pseudococcidae) in semi-field conditions.

Materials and Methods

The botanical insecticides used are listed in Table 1. This research was done in semi-field condition in randomized complete block design (RCBD) in three replicates at Sari Agricultural University.

Rearing insects (*Planococcus citri*)

Semi field assay and experimental design: The toxicity of the three different botanical insecticides (Table 1) to CM was examined in the nursery at Sari Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources University in 2010 and 2011. Seventy-two young trees (4 years) of the citrus variety Thomson Navel (*Citrus sinensis*) nursery within Sari Agricultural University and spray bioassay method were used. Experiments for each treatment were replicated four times, and distilled water was used as a control. At 24, 48, 72 and 96 hours post-treatment, the numbers of live and dead second instar nymphs in each replicate were counted in the laboratory under a stereomicroscope.

The rearing protocol followed was as described by Gerald-Robison (12) and Gharizadeh (13) with some modifications. Citrus mealybug was reared on Butternut pumpkin *Cucurbita moschata* (2-3 kg) in plastic containers (25 cm diameter x 4 cm high) at 25±3°C and 16:8 hrs (dark: light) photoperiod in an incubator. The tops of the containers were covered by Vaseline oil to prevent CM escape and then these CM were used to infest young trees in the nursery.

Insecticides application

Five doses for each insecticide were tested based on pilot experiments, plus a control.

Table 1. Botanical insecticides was used in this research.

Common name	Trade name	Chemical group	Formulation	Dose (ml/1000 Lit water)	LD ₅₀ (mg/kg)	Company
Insecticidal gel (IG)	Sirinol	Garlic Extract in edible oil	EC	0- 3500/1000	> 5000	Kimia sabzavar Co.
Insecticidal soap (IS)	Palizin	Coconut soap 65%	SL	0-3000 /1000	> 5000	Kimia sabzavar Co.
Insecticidal emulsion (IE)	Tondexir	Hot red pepper extract in edible oil	EC	0-3000/1000	> 5000	Kimia sabzavar Co.
Fenprothrin	Danitol	Pyrethroid	EC	400-800ppm	54.0 mg/kg	Bayer

Tondexir and Palizin were used at 0, 500, 1000, 1500, 2000 and 3000 ppm concentration, and Sirinol at 0, 1000, 1500, 2000, 2500 and 3500 ppm concentration. Insect mortality was recorded 24, 48, 72 and 96 hours after treatment.

Statistical analysis

The percentage of mortality was recorded from each treatment and any mortality in the control was corrected using Abbott's formula (1). Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was done using the SPSS program and the comparison of the means was done by Tukeys test (8). The LC₅₀ and LC₉₀ were calculated by polo+ program version 1 2002-2012 Leora software®.

Results

The analysis of variance (ANOVA) has shown that there were significant differences among different concentrations (factor A) and also among different times (factor B) and there were no significant difference for the interaction between dose and time (Table 2).

Table 2. The analysis of variation (ANOVA) of the effect of three botanical insecticides on mortality rate of the second nymphs of *P. citri*.

Source of variation	Df	Palizin	Sirinol	Tondexir
Block	2	55.58	315.05	105.09
Doses	5	10807.50**	9616.33**	11225.18**
Times	3	988.52**	1319.11**	846.59**
Doses ×Times	15	80.20	80.56	80.106
Error	46	47.13	52.16	70.07
Coefficient of variation	71	15.53	15.99	17.93

** Significant differences at P=0.01.

The results have also shown that the highest mortality of CM was obtained when using the 3000 ppm dose of Palizin and Tondexir (89.16±1.92% and 90.96±2.93%,

respective mortality) and at the 3500 ppm dose of Sirinol (87.11±1.11% mortality). The lowest mortality was obtained with Palizin and Tondexir at the 500 ppm dose and by Sirinol at the 1000 ppm dose. There were significant differences among different doses of the above three toxins on *P. citri* (Table 3).

Table 3. Effect of different concentrations of three botanical insecticides on mean mortality rate of *P. citri*.

Dose (ppm)	Palizin	Tondexir	Dose (ppm)	Sirinol
0.0	24.73 e	27.91 e	0.00	35.13 d
500	38.27 d	41.66 d	1000	40.41 d
1000	52.63 c	53.74 c	1500	45.00 c
1500	58.47 b	64.13 b	2000	61.11 b
2000	89.16 a	90.96 a	2500	87.11 a
3000	1.80 f	1.87 f	3500	2.03 e

Means followed by the same letters are not significantly different at P=0.01.

The highest mortality was obtained at 72 and 96 hrs post-treatment, and there was no significant difference between 72 and 96 hrs post-treatment when using Palizin and Sirinol. The highest mortality obtained with Tondexir was at 96 hrs post-treatment. The highest mortality for each of the toxins was obtained 96 hrs post-treatment (Table 4).

Table 4. *P. citri* mortality rate as influenced by different doses of toxins observed at different periods after treatment.

Hours post treatment	Palizin	Sirinol	Tondexir
24	34.45c	34.59c	37.47c
48	42.84b	42.19b	45.72b
72	47.86a	49.87a	50.25ab
96	51.59a	53.94a	53.21a

Means followed by the same letters are not significantly different at P=0.01.

The effect of different concentrations of botanical insecticides on *P. citri* at different times post treatment is

shown in Table 5. There were significant differences between different doses of all toxins and between the toxins and the control. The highest mortality was obtained at the 3000 ppm dose of Palizin and Tonexir, and at the 3500 ppm dose of Sirinol, 96 hrs post-treatment (Table 5).

The LC₅₀ of Palizin was 811.297 ppm, followed by Tondexir (821.716 ppm) and Sirinol (1562.125 ppm) (Table 6). There was no toxicity effect of Tondexir and Palizin and Sirinol on all stages of the coccinellid predator, 96 hrs post-treatment.

Table 5. *P. citri* mortality rate (%) means as influenced by different doses of toxins from botanical extracts observed at different times after treatment.

Dose (ppm)	Time after treat. (hrs)	Tondexir	Palizin	Dose (ppm)	Time after treat. (hrs)	Sirinol
0.0	24	11.7 gh	10.6 fg	0.0	24	20.0 fg
0.0	48	27.8 fg	21.1 eg	0.0	48	27.2 fg
0.0	72	32.2 eg	30.6 dg	0.0	72	43.9 cf
0.0	96	40.0 df	36.7 cg	0.0	96	49.4 bf
500	24	30.2 fg	31.6 dg	1000	24	28.9 eg
500	48	38.2 df	35.8 dg	1000	48	38.3 dg
500	72	45.8 df	40.9 bf	1000	72	44.4 cf
500	96	53.4 be	44.9 bf	1000	96	50.0 bf
1000	24	46.7 de	43.7 bf	1500	24	30.6 fg
1000	48	52.8 be	51.1 be	1500	48	44.4 cf
1000	72	57.8 bd	57.8 ae	1500	72	48.3 bf
1000	96	57.8 bd	58.3 ae	1500	96	56.7 af
1500	24	48.4 ef	42.8 bf	2000	24	47.2 bf
1500	48	61.5 bd	53.6 be	2000	48	55.6 af
1500	72	71.7 ac	62.8 ad	2000	72	68.3 ae
1500	96	75.0 ac	74.4 ac	2000	96	73.3 ad
2000	24	86.1 a	76.7 ab	2500	24	78.9 ac
2000	48	92.2 a	93.3 a	2500	48	85.6 ab
2000	72	92.2 a	93.3 a	2500	72	92.2 a
2000	96	92.2 a	93.3 a	2500	96	92.2 a
3000	24	1.9 h	1.9 g	3500	24	2.0 g
3000	48	1.9 h	1.9 g	3500	48	2.0 g
3000	72	1.9 h	1.9 g	3500	72	2.0 g
3000	96	1.9 h	1.9 g	3500	96	2.0 g

Means followed by the same letters are not significantly different at P=0.01

Table 6. The LC₅₀ and LC₉₀ of different toxins on the second instar nymphs of *P. citri*.

LC	Tondexir	Palizin	Sirinol	Phenproprathrin
LC ₅₀ (ppm)	821.716	811.297	1562.125	414.919
LC ₉₀ (ppm)	3452.861	3672.584	4937.732	1083.341

Discussion

This study is the first to quantitatively demonstrate that commercially available plant extract products vary in their efficacy against certain arthropod pests. The popularity of "organic" products and the general interest in sustainable crop production led to an extended interest in using "natural" products, such as plant extracts, for pest control.

The effect of these three botanical insecticides as a biological control of *P. citri* has been evaluated here for the first time. Many chemical insecticides have been used to control *P. citri*; methomyl, dimethoate and buprofezin the Insect Growth Regulators (IGR), which decreased the insect population, but they are harmful to natural enemies (9, 22).

This study showed that botanical insecticides are preferable for the control of this insect pest due to having fewer negative effects on natural enemies of the target pests than conventional chemical insecticides. The effect of botanical extracts on mealy bugs is slower than synthetic insecticides, but they are eco-friendly and comparatively non-toxic or less toxic to human beings and easily degradable (3, 21).

Tondexir, Sirinol and Palizin were effective for controlling *P. citri*, with Tondexir producing the highest mortality of citrus mealybug, at 3000 ppm. This result was similar to what was obtained by Mohamed *et al.* (20). The high mortality obtained by using Tondexir and Palizin at 3000 ppm, and with Sirinol at 3500 ppm were in agreement with the result obtained earlier by Hollingsworth (15). These pesticides had no toxic effects on the coccinellids which is in agreement to what was obtained by Aida *et al.* (3). The same results were obtained earlier when using Palizin and Tondexir and *Bacillus thuringiensis* plus mineral oils against citrus leafminer (4, 5, 6, 7). Tondexir, Palizin and Sirinol are promising botanical insecticides and have the potential to be a significant component of an IPM program.

Several pest management tools must often be used simultaneously to deal with pest insect species. Natural plant extracts and biological control agents are two such tools that are used simultaneously because of their effectiveness, potential compatibility, and minimal risk to the environment and human health. Results of this study indicated that botanical pesticides conserve coccinellid predators better than the chemical pesticide fenproprathrin. Hence, it can be concluded that botanical pesticides were the most favorable insecticides for use in controlling *P. citri* because they kill the target pest but have no effect on natural enemies.

However, chemical toxins produced by plants may not only be detrimental to insect and mite pests (e. g. Palizin, Tonexir and Sirinol), but also to humans (11). For example, peppermint and rosemary oil have been shown to be effective against head louse, *Pediculus humanus capitis* De Geer (24) but contact dermatitis and occupational asthma have been attributed to exposure to rosemary oil (17).

The results of this study demonstrated that only a few selected plant-derived essential products available to consumers were effective in controlling specific arthropod pests. There was considerable variation in citrus mealybug mortality in response to the plant-derived essential oil products evaluated, which included products containing the same active ingredients. For example, the use of two canola oil products Garden Safe Houseplant and Garden Insect Spray (ready to use formulation) and Pyola, a canola oil concentrate, led to citrus mealybug mortality values of 74% and 50%, respectively.

Further research is needed to establish cultivation guidelines to ensure consistent quality of plant extract

products. It is also important to assess phytotoxicity amongst commonly grown ornamental plants before

introducing plant extract products to the marketplace and field testing for several years is needed.

المخلص

الحمدي، م وب. أميري-بيشيلي. 2013. مقارنة تأثير ثلاثة مستخلصات نباتية في الطور الثاني لعذراء *Planococcus citri* (Risso) تحت ظروف المختبر والدينيات. مجلة وقاية النبات العربية، 31(3): 286-290.

تسهم المستخلصات النباتية بدور مهم في الزراعة المستدامة. تمت دراسة تأثير "توندكسیر" (مستخلص الفليفلة)، "سيرينول" (مستخلص الثوم) و"باليزين" (مستخلص اليوكالينوس) في بق الحمضيات الدقيقي (*Planococcus citri* (Risso)) من متشابهات الأجنحة وفصيلة Pseudococcidae ومفترس أبو العيد *Cryptoleamus montrouzeri*. تمت تربية البق الدقيقي على زبدة جوز البقطين (2-3 كغ). استخدم تصميم التجارب العاملي مع قطع عشوائية وستة مكررات لكل مستخلص نباتي تحت ظروف المشتل. تم اختبار كل توكسين بشكل منفصل وسجلت نسبة نفوق البق الدقيقي بعد 24، 48، 72 و96 ساعة بعد المعاملة. حقق "توندكسیر" (3000 جزء بالمليون) أعلى نسبة نفوق للبق الدقيقي (90.96±2.93%)، تبعه "باليزين" (3000 جزء بالمليون) (89.16±1.92%) و"سيرينول" (3500 جزء بالمليون) (87.11±1.11%) بعد 96 ساعة من المعاملة. منع "توندكسیر" (3000 جزء بالمليون) و"باليزين" (3000 جزء بالمليون) و"سيرينول" (3500 جزء بالمليون) ظهور البالغات. ومن بين المستخلصات النباتية، تم الحصول على نسبة نفوق 50% مع "باليزين" (811.297 جزء بالمليون). لم تكن هناك تأثيرات سمية نتيجة استخدام المبيدات النباتية سابقة الذكر في أي من مراحل مفترس أبو العيد *Cryptoleamus montrouzeri*.

كلمات مفتاحية: توندكسیر، باليزين، سيرينول، بق الحمضيات، مفترس أبو العيد.

عنوان المراسلة: ب. أميري-بيشيلي، قسم الحشرات، جامعة ساري الزراعية، إيران، البريد الإلكتروني: Behnamamiri39@yahoo.com

References

1. **Abbott W.S.** 1925. A method of computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. *Journal of Economic Entomology*, 18: 265-267.
2. **Aheer, G., R. Ahmad and A. Amjad.** 2009. Efficacy of different insecticides against cotton mealybug, *Phenacoccus solani* Ferris. *Journal of Agricultural Research*, 47: 47-52.
3. **Aida, H.M., F.M. Saber, H.A. Ahmed and A.A. Sayed.** 2010. Efficiency of certain insecticides on the population(s) of the pink hibiscus mealybug *Maconellicoccus hirsutus* (Green) and their natural enemies under the field condition in Ismailia governorate, Egypt. *Egyptian Academic Journal of Biological Sciences*, 2: 11-17
4. **Amiri Besheli, B.** 2007. Efficacy of *Bacillus thuringiensis* and mineral oil against *Phyllocnistis citrella* Stainton (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae). *International Journal of Agriculture & Biology*, 9: 893-896.
5. **Amiri Besheli, B.** 2008. Efficacy of *Bacillus thuringiensis*, mineral oil, insecticidal emulsion and insecticidal gel against *Phyllocnistis citrella* Stainton (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae). *Plant Protection Science*, 44: 68-73.
6. **Amiri Besheli, B.** 2009. Toxicity evaluation of Tracer, Palizin, Sirinol, Runner and Tondexir with and without mineral oils on *Phyllocnistis citrella* Stainton. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 8: 3382-3386.
7. **Amiri Besheli, B.** 2010. Efficacy of chlorpyrifos-methyl, methoxyfenozide, spinosad, insecticidal gel, insecticidal soap and mineral oil on citrus leafminer. *Journal of Food, Agriculture & Environment*, 8: 668-671.
8. **Ark, H.** 1983. Introduction to probit analysis with (LSTATS) P/PROBAN. *Science Bulletin. Department of Agriculture, Republic of South Africa*, No. 399.
9. **Bentley, W., L. Martin, R. Malakar-Kuenen and K. Daane.** 2002. Vine mealybug, *Planococcus ficus*, Insecticide Trial in Raisin Grape Production, ANR University of California Pub. 21612.16 pp.
10. **Damavandian, M.R. and T. Hashemi.** 2005. The effect of pre spring control on the population of the citrus pest. *Research Letter of Agricultural Sciences*, No. 4
11. **D'Mello, J.P.F.** 1997. *Handbook of Plant and Fungal Toxicants*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
12. **Gerald-Robison, W.** 1972. Microtubular patterns in spermatozoa of coccid insects in relation to bending. *The Journal of Cell Biology*, 52: 66-83.
13. **Gharizadeh, A.** 2002. the use of coccinellide beetle *Cryptolaemus montrouzier* against citrus mealybug. Master thesis of Agricultural Entomology, Isfahan Industrial University.
14. **Hodek I.** 1967. Bionomics and ecology of predaceous coccinellidae. *Annual Review of Entomology*, 12: 79-104.
15. **Hollingsworth, R.** 2005. Limonene, a citrus extract, for control of mealybugs and scale insects. *Journal of Economic Entomology*, 98: 772-779.
16. **Keriokhin, G.** 1947. citrus mealybug under Pseudococinae in the pest of superpiki in Iran and their parasites. *The Journal of Plant Pest and Disease*, 4: 17-34.

17. **Lemiere, C., A. Cartier, S.B. Lehrer and J.L. Malo.** 1996. Occupational asthma caused by aromatic herbs. *Allergy*, 51: 647-649.
18. **Lo, P.L., V.A. Bell and J.T.S. Walker.** 2009. Maximizing the effectiveness of insecticides to control mealybugs in vineyards. *New Zealand Plant Protection*, 62: 296-301.
19. **Mafi, Sh.** 1997. Identification of citrus mealybug in Mazandaran and the study of the predominant of its natural enemies. Master thesis of Agricultural Entomology, Tarbiat Modarras University, 112 pp
20. **Mohamed, G.H., A.M. El-Kady and F.A. Moharum.** 2009. Evaluation of soluble powder formulation of alum and citric acid as alternative pesticides against mealy bugs under filed conditions. *Egyptian Academic Journal of Biological Sciences*, 1: 69 -72.
21. **Nalwar, Y., M. Sayyed, S. Mokle, P. Zanwar and Y. Vibhute.** 2009. Synthesis and insect antifeedant activity of some new chalcones against *Phenacoccus solanopsis*. *World Journal of Chemistry*, 4: 123-126.
22. **Senthil Nathan, S., K. Kalaivani, K. Muruga and P.G. Chung.** 2005. The toxicity and physiological effect of neem limonoide on *Cnaphalocrocis medinalis* (Guenee), the rice leaf folder. *Pesticide Biochemistry and Physiology*, 81:113-122.
23. **Su, H.C.F., R.D. Speirs and P.G. Mahany.** 1972. Toxicity of citrus oils to several stored product insects: laboratory evaluation. *Journal of Economic Entomology*, 65: 1438-1441.
24. **Veal, L.** 1996. The potential effectiveness of essential oils as a treatment for headlice, *Pediculus humanus capitis*. *Complementary Therapies in Nursing and Midwifery*, 2: 97-101.

Received: May 14, 2012; Accepted: August 7, 2012

تاريخ الاستلام: 2012/5/14؛ تاريخ الموافقة على النشر: 2012/8/7